

**Mt Albert Grammar School**

**History Department**

**NAME: TEACHER:**

Achievement Standard History 91437: Analyse different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders

Resource reference: History 3.4 The Northern War

Resource title: Winners write the History

Credits: 5

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Achievement | Achievement with Merit | Achievement with Excellence |
| Analyse different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders. | Analyse, in depth, different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders. | Comprehensively analyse different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders. |

Student instructions

Introduction

You are an investigative journalist preparing an article for a history magazine. The article needs to analyse the different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders.

**The submission date for this assignment is Friday 12th April (Week 11)**

**Key assignment dates:**

**Week 7 Wednesday 13 March – assignment given out, both classes briefed**

**Week 8 Research in Library - 4 periods – both classes (all periods logged by students and fed back to teacher)**

**Week 9 Work at home on assignment ( Log of progress signed by teacher)**

**Week 10 Work at home on assignment (Log of progress signed by teacher)**

**Week 11 Work at home on assignment (Log of progress signed by teacher)**

**Assignment handed in Friday 12th April**

You will be assessed on the depth and comprehensiveness of your analysis. Look carefully at the exemplars in the box in the library.

They are also available electronically from:

[**http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications**](http://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications) **standards/qualifications/ncea/subjects/history/annotated-exemplars/level-3-as91437-b/**

You have four weeks of in-class and out-of-class time to complete this activity.

Tasks

1. **Choose a contested historical event** and select evidence that is relevant to the event. Your selected evidence must allow you to conduct a **comprehensive analysis** of different perspectives on the event. See Resource B below for some ideas of resources or seek assistance from your teacher.

**2**. **Write an introduction** about one page in length that:

* **describes what happened** in your selected event
* **identifies the historical debate** that has resulted from your selected event.

1. **Comprehensively analyse different people’s perspectives** of your chosen event. The different perspectives could be held by **participants, contemporaries, historians, descendants, commentators, journalists, observers, official inquiries, and people today**. These perspectives may be held by individuals and/or by groups.

**For each perspective**, demonstrate thorough engagement with the historical evidence as you:

* **describe and explain** the **perspective of the individual/group**
* analyse each perspective **from the historian’s point of view** to determine whether, in the light of the historical evidence, the perspective was, or is, justifiable.

**Analyse the similarities and the differences** between the various perspectives to draw conclusions about which perspective(s), from the historian’s point of view, has the most validity. Support your views with specific examples.

You could consider **factors that may have shaped the people’s perspectives**, such as:

* + are the people **contemporaries of the event or later commentators**?
  + were they **participants or observers**?
  + what is their **gender, race, ethnicity, social class, or political affiliation?**
  + has **new evidence about the event** recently come to light?

4. Write your article

Write your article. It should contain:

* an introductory paragraph, which outlines your chosen event and its area(s) of contention
* a series of paragraphs that analyse the various perspectives
* **an analysis comparison of the perspectives**
* a conclusion, which justifies the perspective(s) you support
* specific, referenced supporting evidence.

**5. Helpful hints**

* Photographs need to be captioned and acknowledged by source including retrieval date
* Bibme is extremely useful for looking up the accurate source of a particular site

http://www.bibme.org/

Resource A Useful sources

* Te Ara Encyclopedia of New Zealand <http://www.teara.govt.nz/>
* New Zealand History Online <http://www.nzhistory.net.nz/>
* Radio New Zealand Sound Archives <http://www.soundarchives.co.nz/>
* The Dictionary of New Zealand Biography <http://www.dnzb.govt.nz/dnzb/>
* Ministry of Culture and Heritage <http://www.mch.govt.nz/>
* National Library <http://www.natlib.govt.nz/>
* Papers Past [http://www.natlib.govt.nz/collections/digital-collections/papers-past/](http://www.natlib.govt.nz/collections/digital-collections/papers-past/?searchterm=papers%20past)
* Te Puna (A guide to NZ and Pacific websites)<http://webdirectory.natlib.govt.nz>
* Timeframes (a database of pictures from National Library Collection)<http://www.natlib.govt.nz/collections/digital-collections/timeframes>
* Epic (a suite of databases) “Australia and New Zealand Reference centre” could be of interest:<http://www.tki.org.nz/epic2>
* You Tube <http://www.youtube.com/>
* Index New Zealand <http://www.natlib.govt.nz/catalogues/innz> (The index lists information about articles published in more than 400 New Zealand newspapers, magazines, and journals)
* Te Pātaka Matihiko Digistore [http://digistore.tki.org.nz/ec/p/home](#http://digistore.tki.org.nz/ec/p/home)
* New Zealand Cartoon Archive <http://www.cartoons.org.nz/>
* National Oral History Association of New Zealand <http://www.oralhistory.org.nz/resources.htm>
* Oral History Centre <http://natlib.govt.nz/collections/a-z/oral-history-centre>
* Dictionary of New Zealand Biography [dnzb.govt.nz](http://www.worldcat.org/wcpa/oclc/155846943?page=frame&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.dnzb.govt.nz%2F%26checksum%3D0bf801720d06f461f2846e23308edb70&title=&linktype=digitalObject&detail=" \o "http://www.dnzb.govt.nz/" \t "_blank)
* Secondary texts, biographies and periodicals
* Local museums and history societies
* Local archives (e.g. council, library, museum, photographic, film)
* Newspapers and magazines
* Artefacts
* Historical sites
* Key people (e.g. local specialists, local residents)
* Records of community organisations (e.g. church archives)
* Cartoons
* Local history books
* Films or TV documentaries The New Zealand Wars
* Public and school libraries.

Resource B: Contested historical events

Contested historical event of significance to New Zealanders that could be used with this activity include:

* **The early breaches of the Treaty of Waitangi were the reasons for the outbreak of the Northern War**
* **Pākehā won the Northern War**
* **Maori were the first to invent trench warfare**
* **The New Zealand Wars were fought primarily over the issue of sovereignty**
* **The Northern Wars divided Maori against Maori**
* **Ohaewhai was a victory for Maori**
* **Or negoatiate an event with your teacher**

**Note that some of these contested events are broad and some quite specific. If you are thinkng like an historian, you will see the ‘contest’ through the historiography.**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **LOG OF SELF MANAGEMENT- TO BE SUBMITTED WITH ASSIGNMENT** | | |
| **Name: Class: Teacher:** | | |
| **DATE:** | **PROGRESS** |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |

Assessment schedule: History 91437 Different opinions

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Evidence/Judgements for Achievement | Evidence/Judgements for Achievement with Merit | Evidence/Judgements for Achievement with Excellence |
| The student analysed different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders by:   * identifying different perspectives * using supporting evidence to explain what the different perspectives are, and why they are held.   For example:  William Fox in this extract from his book The Six Colonies of New Zealand (1851) supported the idea of fatal impact. He believed that Māori were a dying race. He stated, “the gulf between him and the newcomer is too great; he cannot imagine the possibility of bridging it so he sits down and broods in silence till his appointed time [death].” Fox believed that Māori would cease to exist in his lifetime…  New Zealand historian Andrew Sharp has his own views about how there was a fatal impact for Māori …  James Belich was no believer in the helpless demise of Māori at the hands of Pakeha, however…  The examples above relate to only part of what is required, and are just indicative. | The student analysed, in-depth, different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders by:   * identifying different perspectives * using supporting evidence to explain what the different perspectives are and why they are held * evaluating, as an historian, the validity of different perspectives of the contested event * presenting an opinion, with reasons, on the validity of the perspectives.   For example:  William Fox in this extract from his book The Six Colonies of New Zealand (1851) supported the idea of fatal impact. He believed that Māori were a dying race. He stated, “the gulf between him and the newcomer is too great; he cannot imagine the possibility of bridging it so he sits down and broods in silence till his appointed time [death].” This perspective is very different to that held by James Belich. Belich believes in the idea of Māori agency. He argues that Māori selected, on their own terms, which aspects of European contact they would adopt and which they would reject. Māori were active participants rather than passive in their interaction with Pākehā (as Fox believed). Belich uses such evidence as Māori syncretic religions – for example, Pai Marire, a blend of both Māori and European Christian traditions – to support his ideas. The perspectives of Fox and Belich differ because Fox lived in early 19th century New Zealand and observed Māori dying a as a result of disease and war. Ideas of European superiority were widely held at this time. Belich however, is a historian who, through his research, has discredited the long-held view of fatal impact …  Belich’s views are the most credible …  The examples above relate to only part of what is required, and are just indicative. | The student comprehensively analysed different perspectives of a contested event of significance to New Zealanders by:   * identifying different perspectives * using supporting evidence to explain what the different perspectives are and why they are held * making judgements as an historian on the validity of different perspectives * drawing conclusions that demonstrate thorough engagement with the evidence and the ideas it contains.   For example:  William Fox in this extract from his book The Six Colonies of New Zealand (1851) supported the idea of fatal impact. He believed that Māori were a dying race. He stated “the gulf between him and the newcomer is too great; he cannot imagine the possibility of bridging it, so he sits down and broods in silence till his appointed time [death].” This perspective is very different to that held by James Belich. Belich believes in the idea of Māori agency. He argues that Māori selected, on their own terms, which aspects of European contact they would adopt and which they would reject. Māori were active participants rather than passive in their interaction with Pākehā (as Fox believed). Belich uses such evidence as Māori syncretic religions – for example, Pai Marire, a blend of both Māori and European Christian traditions – to support his ideas, The perspectives of Fox and Belich differ because Fox lived in early 19th century New Zealand and observed Māori dying a as a result of disease and war. Ideas of European superiority were widely held at this time. Belich, however, is a historian who, through his research, has discredited the long-held view of fatal impact.  Care needs to be taken by historians when dealing with evidence from those close to events. In 1851 New Zealand a Pākehā politician such as Fox may have been very much inclined to the political views of constituents or simply lacking in the sort of statistics to support his contentions. The views of his constituents would have been very obvious to Fox …  I strongly support the perspectives held that Māori actively engaged with Pākehā for their own advantage. Examples such as syncretic religions, the ownership of businesses such as flour mills, and the adaptation of warfare, all point to Māori agency. Belich’s arguments about Māori battle tactics and their success are particularly compelling. Not only did Māori lose nothing of value in battles such as at Ruapekapeka, but their ability to acquire Pākehā weaponry and adapt their traditional fighting tactics to combat their opponents’ tactics suggests that these were highly adaptive and imaginative people who knew what they wanted and how to get it.  The examples above relate to only part of what is required, and are just indicative. |

Final grades will be decided using professional judgement based on a holistic examination of the evidence provided against the criteria in the Achievement Standard.